

MINUTES OF THE
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
AIR QUALITY TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING

Thursday, May 26, 2016

MAG Office

Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

- | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | Tim Conner, Scottsdale, Chairman | | |
| * | Jamie McCullough, El Mirage, Vice Chair | * | Liz Foster for Jeanette Fish, Maricopa County Farm Bureau |
| | Drew Bryck, Avondale | * | Steve Trussell, Arizona Rock Products Association |
| | Susan Avans for Robert van den Akker, Buckeye | * | Claudia Whitehead, Greater Phoenix Chamber of Commerce |
| | Jon Sherrill, Chandler | | Amanda McGennis, Associated General Contractors |
| * | Hondo Judd, Gilbert | * | Spencer Kamps, Homebuilders Association of Central Arizona |
| | Megan Sheldon, Glendale | # | Mannie Carpenter, Valley Forward |
| * | Cato Esquivel, Goodyear | # | Kai Umeda, University of Arizona Cooperative Extension |
| * | Kazi Haque, Maricopa | | Beverly Chenausky, Arizona Department of Transportation |
| # | Greg Edwards, Mesa | * | Marina Mejia, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality |
| | Stuart Kent, Peoria | * | Environmental Protection Agency |
| | Joe Gibbs for Joe Giudice, Phoenix | | Hether Krause, Maricopa County Air Quality Department |
| # | Antonio DeLaCruz, Surprise | | Scott DiBiase, Pinal County |
| | Oddvar Tveit, Tempe | * | Michelle Wilson, Arizona Department of Weights and Measures |
| * | Youngtown | @ | Ed Stillings, Federal Highway Administration |
| * | Ramona Simpson, Queen Creek | # | Judi Nelson, Arizona State University |
| * | Walter Bouchard, American Lung Association of Arizona | | Stan Belone, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community |
| | Kristin Watt, Salt River Project | | |
| * | Rebecca Hudson-Nunez, Southwest Gas Corporation | | |
| | Michael Denby, Arizona Public Service Company | | |
| * | Gina Grey, Western States Petroleum Association | | |
| # | Amanda Luecker for Robert Forrest, Valley Metro/RPTA | | |
| * | Dave Berry, Arizona Motor Transport Association | | |

*Members neither present nor represented by proxy.

#Participated via telephone conference call.

+Participated via video conference call.

@ Ex-Officio member, non-voting member.

OTHERS PRESENT

Lindy Bauer, Maricopa Association of Governments
Matt Poppen, Maricopa Association of Governments
Kara Johnson, Maricopa Association of Governments
Dean Giles, Maricopa Association of Governments
Taejoo Shin, Maricopa Association of Governments
Randy Sedlacek, Maricopa Association of Governments
Teri Kennedy, Maricopa Association of Governments

Philip Loftis, Maricopa Department of Transportation
Joonwon Joo, Arizona Department of Transportation
Carly Akine, City of Glendale
Diane Barker, Citizenry

1. Call to Order

A meeting of the Maricopa Association of Governments (MAG) Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee (AQTAC) was conducted on May 26, 2016. Tim Conner, City of Scottsdale, Chair, called the meeting to order at approximately 1:30 p.m. Judi Nelson, Arizona State University; Mannie Carpenter, Valley Forward; Kai Umeda, University of Arizona Cooperative Extension; Greg Edwards, City of Mesa; Amanda Luecker, Valley Metro; and Antonio DeLaCruz, City of Surprise, attended the meeting via telephone conference call.

Chair Conner indicated that copies of the handouts for the meeting are available. He noted for members attending through audio conference, the presentations for the meeting will be posted on the MAG website under Resources for the Committee agenda, whenever possible. If it is not possible to post them before the meeting, they will be posted after the meeting.

2. Call to the Audience

Chair Conner stated that the Call to the Audience provides an opportunity for members of the public to address the Committee on items not scheduled on the agenda that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or on items on the agenda for discussion but not for action. Comment cards for those wishing to speak are available on the tables adjacent to the doorways inside the meeting room. Members of the public will be requested not to exceed a three minute time period for their comments. A total of 15 minutes will be provided for the Call to the Audience agenda item, unless the Committee requests an exception to this limit. Please note that those wishing to comment on action agenda items will be given an opportunity at the time the item is heard. Chair Conner noted that no public comment cards had been received.

3. Approval of the March 24, 2016 Meeting Minutes

The Committee reviewed the minutes from the March 24, 2016 meeting. Stan Belone, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community, moved and Hether Krause, Maricopa County Air Quality Department, seconded, and the motion to approve the March 24, 2016 meeting minutes carried unanimously.

4. Draft April 2016 Conformity Analysis for the Draft FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and Draft Amendment to the 2035 MAG Regional Transportation Plan

Dean Giles, Maricopa Association of Governments, presented the Draft April 2016 Conformity Analysis for the Draft FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) and Draft Amendment to the 2035 MAG Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). He stated the April 2016 Conformity Analysis and the results for the regional emissions analysis conclude that the draft TIP and RTP meet the requirements for a new finding of conformity. Mr. Giles indicated that the Clean Air Act links transportation and air quality and requires that transportation plans, programs, and projects conform or be consistent with goals in the regional air quality plans. Conformity ensures that transportation activities do not cause violations of the Federal air quality standards. Mr. Giles noted that air quality plans establish motor vehicle emissions budgets that are used for the conformity tests.

Mr. Giles stated that the federal conformity regulations specifies four criteria that are required for a conformity determination. The TIP and RTP must pass the conformity emissions tests using an Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) approved budget or a budget that is found to be adequate for transportation conformity purposes. Mr. Giles noted that an interim emissions test is used in areas without an approved or adequate budget. He indicated that the additional requirements for the conformity analysis include: utilization of the latest planning assumptions and emissions models; the TIP and RTP are required to provide timely implementation of transportation control measures from air quality plans; and consultation. Mr. Giles noted that EPA model MOVES2014a and the latest vehicle registration data from the Arizona Department of Transportation, indicated in Table Four, were used for the conformity analysis. MAG distributed copies of the Draft April 2016 Conformity Analysis for consultation to members of the MAG Management Committee on May 6, 2016. A copy is provided in the Committee materials.

Mr. Giles discussed conformity and the expanded MAG metropolitan planning area (MPA) boundary. He stated that the expanded MAG MPA boundary and the Sun Corridor Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) MPA boundary include portions of the Pinal County PM-10 and PM-2.5 nonattainment areas. The MAG and Sun Corridor MPO boundaries completely cover both Pinal County nonattainment areas. Both metropolitan planning organizations are required to demonstrate transportation conformity for both nonattainment areas.

Mr. Giles presented a map that includes: the carbon monoxide maintenance area; the PM-10 nonattainment area; the 8-hour ozone nonattainment area; the PM-2.5 nonattainment area; the Pinal County PM-10 nonattainment area; the MAG MPA; and the Sun Corridor MPA. Mr. Giles noted that portions of both MPOs cover the West Pinal County PM-10 and PM-2.5 nonattainment areas.

Mr. Giles provided the regional emissions analysis results for the Maricopa County nonattainment and maintenance areas. He discussed the carbon monoxide (CO) results for the conformity budget test in the Maricopa County maintenance area. For analysis year 2015, the projected emissions from the implementation of the draft TIP and RTP are less than the budget established in the MAG 2003 Carbon Monoxide Maintenance Plan. For years 2025 and 2035, the projected emissions from the draft TIP and RTP are less than the budget established in the MAG 2013 Carbon Monoxide Maintenance Plan.

Amanda McGennis, Associated General Contractors, asked if the budget was marked as the white bar and the emissions were marked as the blue bar in the table. Mr. Giles responded yes. He stated that the results indicate that the draft TIP and RTP meet the conformity test for CO.

Mr. Giles presented the eight-hour ozone results for the conformity budget test for the Maricopa County nonattainment area. He stated that the conformity test utilized the EPA approved motor vehicle emissions budget for the ozone precursors, volatile organic compounds (VOC) and nitrogen oxides (NOx). The projected VOC emissions from the implementation of the draft TIP and RTP for analysis year 2017 are less than the budget established in the MAG 2007 Eight-Hour Ozone Plan. For years 2025 and 2035, the projected VOC emissions from the draft TIP and Plan are less than the budget established in the MAG 2009 Eight-Hour Redesignation Request and Maintenance Plan.

Mr. Giles provided the eight-hour ozone results for NO_x. The projected NO_x emissions from the implementation of the draft TIP and RTP for analysis year 2017 are less than the budget established in the MAG 2007 Eight-Hour Ozone Plan. For years 2025 and 2035, the projected NO_x emissions from implementation of the draft TIP and Plan are less than the budget established in the MAG 2009 Eight-Hour Redesignation Request and Maintenance Plan. The results indicate that the draft TIP and RTP meet the conformity test for eight-hour ozone.

Michael Denby, Arizona Public Service Company, inquired about the VOC and NO_x emissions measurement of metric tons per day in relation to ozone that is measured as parts per million. He asked how the emissions relate to nonattainment of the current ozone standard. Mr. Giles replied that the ozone concentrations are converted to metric tons per day. Lindy Bauer, Maricopa Association of Governments, added that the ozone standard measures the ozone concentration in parts per million. She stated that the ozone emissions are measured in metric tons per day. The Clean Air Act requires that the Regional Transportation Plan and the Transportation Improvement Program fit into the motor vehicle emission budget when modeling attainment for an air quality plan.

Mr. Denby asked that parts per million and metric tons per day are two different items. Ms. Bauer responded that the two are different units. She stated that when the standard is met, there are emissions in the air. When modeling attainment, a pie chart displays the emissions breakdown. Ms. Bauer indicated that the motor vehicle emissions budget is one component of the pie chart. The motor vehicle emissions budget is required in the Clean Air Act to ensure that transportation plans, programs, and projects do not contribute to violations of the air quality standards. Under Section 176 of the Clean Air Act, metropolitan planning organizations are not allowed to approve transportation plans, programs, or project unless it is in conformance with the applicable air quality plans.

Mr. Denby inquired if the numbers in metric tons per day are favorable with regard to the 0.070 parts per million ozone standard. Ms. Bauer replied that there is no plan completed for the 2015 ozone standard. The approved EPA motor vehicle emission budgets are from approved plans for other EPA ozone standards.

Mr. Giles provided the PM-10 results for the conformity budget test for the Maricopa County nonattainment area. He stated that the conformity test utilized the EPA approved motor vehicle emissions budget established in the MAG 2012 Five Percent Plan for PM-10. For analysis years 2015, 2025, and 2035, the projected PM-10 emissions from the draft TIP and Plan are less than the 2012 budget. In addition, the chart displays the 2006 budget from the MAG 1999 Serious Area Particulate Plan for PM-10. Mr. Giles noted that the 2006 budget was included due to the pending legal challenge to the EPA approval of the MAG 2012 Five Percent Plan for PM-10. He stated that the results indicate that the draft TIP and RTP meet the conformity test for PM-10 in the Maricopa County nonattainment area.

Mr. Giles presented the results for the Pinal County PM-10 and PM-2.5 nonattainment areas. He discussed the PM-10 results for the conformity interim emission test. For analysis years 2020, 2030, 2035, and 2040, the projected PM-10 action emissions are less than the projected baseline emissions. A PM-10 conformity budget test was also conducted using the submitted budget from the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality 2015 West Pinal Moderate PM-

10 Nonattainment Area State Implementation Plan. Mr. Giles stated that the test was performed using the budget from the Pinal Moderate PM-10 Plan to ensure that any future budget approval or adequacy finding does not interfere with the conformity determination. The emissions for analysis years 2018, 2020, 2030, 2035, and 2040, are less than the projected 2018 budget.

Ed Stillings, Federal Highway Administration, inquired if the Sun Corridor projects were included in the results for the PM-10 conformity interim emission test. Mr. Giles responded yes. He stated that MAG has coordinated with the Sun Corridor MPO to include proposed projects.

Mr. Giles provided the PM-2.5 results for the Pinal County PM-2.5 nonattainment area. He indicated that the conformity interim emission test is required for both PM-2.5 and NOx. For analysis years 2020, 2030, 2035, and 2040, the projected PM-2.5 action emissions are less than the projected baseline emissions.

Mr. Giles presented the NOx results for the Pinal County PM-2.5 nonattainment area. For analysis years 2020, 2030, 2035, and 2040, the projected NOx action emissions are less than the projected baseline emissions. Mr. Giles noted that the results indicate that the draft TIP and RTP meet the conformity test for PM-2.5 in the Pinal County nonattainment area.

Mr. Giles provided the conformity schedule. On May 5, 2016, the Draft Conformity Analysis document was made available for a 30-day public review. Today, the Committee may make a recommendation to approve the Draft April 2016 Conformity Analysis. The public hearing for the Draft April 2016 Conformity Analysis, Draft FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and Draft Amendment to the 2035 MAG Regional Transportation Plan, will be conducted on June 7, 2016. The Draft 2016 MAG Conformity Analysis would then proceed to the MAG Management Committee on June 8, 2016. On June 22, 2016, the MAG Regional Council may take approval action on the finding of conformity. The final determination of conformity is anticipated in July 2016 by the Federal Highway Administration and Federal Transit Administration.

Ms. Bauer noted that to date no comments have been received. She stated that should comments be received on the conformity analysis at the public hearing, the response to comments will be transmitted to the Committee.

Chair Conner requested a motion to recommend approval of the Draft April 2016 Conformity Analysis for the Draft FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and Draft Amendment to the 2035 MAG Regional Transportation Plan. Oddvar Tveit, City of Tempe, requested that the Committee be able to review any significant public comments. Joe Gibbs, City of Phoenix, moved, and Stuart Kent, City of Peoria, seconded, and the motion to recommend approval of the Draft April 2016 Conformity Analysis for the Draft FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and Draft Amendment to the 2035 MAG Regional Transportation Plan carried unanimously.

5. Update on the Moderate Area Ozone Plan

Ms. Bauer provided an update on the MAG Eight-Hour Ozone Moderate Area Plan for the Maricopa Nonattainment Area. On May 4, 2016 EPA published the final notice in the Federal Register that determined the Maricopa eight-hour ozone nonattainment area did not attain the

standard and would be reclassified from Marginal to Moderate. Ms. Bauer noted that the Moderate Plan is for the 0.075 ozone ppm standard established by EPA in 2008. She stated that MAG is proceeding with extensive modeling that covers the entire ozone season. Ms. Bauer indicated that it appears no additional measures will be required for the attainment demonstration. The benefits from the existing 93 local, state, and federal ozone control measures already in place in the Maricopa nonattainment area will be utilized for the attainment demonstration.

Ms. Bauer stated that MAG is working with the Maricopa County Air Quality Department on the Reasonably Available Control Measure Analysis. Additionally, the Maricopa County Air Quality Department is working on the Reasonably Available Control Technology which is a separate, independent requirement for Moderate areas.

6. Ozone Boundary Designations

Ms. Bauer presented an update on the ozone boundary designations for the 2015 ozone standard of 0.070 ppm. The Arizona Department of Environmental Quality (ADEQ) has implemented a process to evaluate the ozone nonattainment areas throughout the state. Ms. Bauer displayed a map of the current Maricopa Eight-Hour Ozone Nonattainment Area that encompasses 5,017 square miles. Based on 2013 through 2015 monitoring data, 13 air quality monitors in the current ozone boundary do not meet the 0.070 ppm standard. Ms. Bauer indicated that based on 2016 monitoring data, only seven monitors do not meet the 0.070 ppm standard. However, she stated that the 2016 ozone season is not over.

Ms. Bauer discussed the expansion of the Maricopa eight-hour ozone nonattainment area boundary to include two monitors outside the nonattainment area that slightly exceed the 2015 ozone standard. She stated that the Tonto National Monument monitor, located in the Tonto National Forest in Gila County, has a reading of 0.071 ppm. The Queen Valley monitor is located in Pinal County on the boarder of the Tonto National Forest, also has a reading of 0.071 ppm. She stated that when evaluating the 2016 monitoring data, the Tonto National Monument monitor is currently below the standard. Ms. Bauer noted that the Queen Valley monitor currently has one exceedance at 0.071 ppm, however the other readings meet the 0.070 ppm standard. She stated that the monitor can experience a few exceedances. Ms. Bauer commented that there is hope that the monitors will meet the 0.070 ppm ozone standard in 2016. Ms. Bauer noted the downward trend at both the Tonto National Monument and Queen Valley monitors.

Ms. Bauer indicated that, based upon the downward trend in the monitoring data and that both monitors only slightly exceed the standard, the boundary does not need to be expanded at this time. Ms. Bauer stated that ADEQ is required to submit the designation recommendations for attainment or nonattainment to EPA based upon 2013 to 2015 ozone monitoring data by October 1, 2016. On April 14, 2016, ADEQ conducted a public hearing in which they proposed to expand the Maricopa eight-hour ozone nonattainment area to include the Tonto National Monument monitor and the Pinal County Queen Valley monitor.

Ms. Bauer stated that ADEQ had indicated that they would be willing to consider 2016 monitoring data after making a recommendation to expand the ozone boundary. EPA guidance documents for the ozone designations encourages states to consider 2016 data in making the

recommendations. When making the designations, EPA will be looking at newer data. Ms. Bauer noted that looking at newer data is important when there are downward trends in concentration and emissions data. She stated that MAG recommended that ADEQ look at newer data as well. Ms. Bauer noted that there were concerns about making it through the ADEQ public process in a timely manner while waiting for newer 2016 data.

Ms. Bauer stated that on April 27, 2016 MAG discussed the matter with the MAG Regional Council who took approval action to send a letter to ADEQ requesting that the boundary not be expanded at this time due the downward trend in the monitoring data and that both monitors only slightly exceed the standard. The MAG Regional Council discussed that the 2016 monitoring data should be evaluated to determine if a change to the boundary is necessary or if the monitors may come into compliance. On May 5, 2016, ADEQ responded to the letter by setting up a meeting with Maricopa County Air Quality Department, Pinal County Air Quality Department, and MAG to discuss the data. ADEQ indicated that the preferred option would be the current boundary, however there may be additional options. On May 23, 2016, ADEQ held a stakeholder meeting to discuss four options to be recommended by the State to EPA by October 1, 2016.

Ms. Bauer discussed the four options. The four options allow for consideration of newer, more recent air quality data, which may be cleaner. Ms. Bauer stated that EPA will be evaluating 2014 through 2016 data, possibly 2017 data, in which EPA will be finalizing the boundary designation by October 1, 2017. She indicated that if the downward trend continues and the two monitors meet the standard, the boundary would not need to be expanded. ADEQ indicated that these options provide a streamlined approach rather than revising the recommendation after it is made. All four options can go through the public review process and when provided to EPA, EPA can make a decision by October 1, 2017.

Ms. Bauer presented the ADEQ proposed map of the ozone nonattainment boundary if Queen Valley monitor and the Gila County monitor are both attaining given the 2016 monitoring data. She noted that the map shows the current eight-hour ozone nonattainment area boundary. In this option, the boundary would not be expanded.

Ms. Bauer presented the ADEQ proposed map of the ozone nonattainment boundary if the Gila County monitor is not attaining and the Queen Valley monitor is attaining given the 2016 monitoring data. In this option, the boundary would be expanded to include just the Tonto National Monument monitor in Gila County.

Ms. Bauer presented the ADEQ proposed map of the ozone nonattainment boundary if the Queen Valley monitor is not attaining and the Gila County monitor is attaining given the 2016 monitoring data. In this option, the boundary would be expanded to include just the Queen Valley monitor. Ms. Bauer noted that this proposed boundary is similar to what was proposed before, however there is a property owned by the Salt River Project that has been included in this option. She indicated that MAG discussed the inclusion of the Salt River Project land with Pinal County.

Ms. Bauer presented the ADEQ proposed map of the ozone nonattainment boundary if both the Queen Valley and the Tonto National Monument monitors are not attaining given the 2016

monitoring data. In this option, the boundary would be expanded to include both monitors. Ms. Bauer indicated that all four options would be proposed to EPA.

Ms. Bauer discussed the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality boundary designation schedule. She stated that a stakeholder meeting was conducted on May 23, 2016. ADEQ will now prepare a draft designations document. The document will undergo a public review process in May and June of 2016. Ms. Bauer stated that ADEQ will submit designations to the Governor for consideration in August or September 2016. The Governor would then submit the designations document to EPA by October 1, 2016. Ms. Bauer indicated that MAG had expressed appreciation to ADEQ at the stakeholder meeting for the four options that allow EPA the option of considering newer data and the potential of not expanding the ozone nonattainment area boundary.

Mr. Denby inquired if there are more monitors beyond the boundaries shown in the ADEQ maps that may be of concern in the future. Ms. Bauer responded that there are other monitors in Pinal County, however they are below the standard. She stated that the Tonto National Monument monitor is the only ozone monitor in Gila County. Ms. Bauer asked if Scott DiBiase, Pinal County, would like to add anything. Mr. DiBiase replied that Ms. Bauer covered the Pinal County monitors.

7. CMAQ Annual Report

Mr. Giles provided the Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) Annual Report for 2015. The Federal Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program requires that a CMAQ Annual Report be prepared that specifies how CMAQ funds have been spent during the prior fiscal year and the anticipated air quality benefits. The annual report for fiscal year ending September 30, 2015 was submitted to the Federal Highway Administration in April 2016. Mr. Giles noted that the report is in the electronic format produced by the Federal Highway Administration's CMAQ tracking system. He thanked the Arizona Department of Transportation for their assistance and review of the Annual Report.

Mr. Giles reviewed the CMAQ projects included in the report. He stated that the Committee has seen these projects before when they were submitted for possible CMAQ funding and inclusion in the Transportation Improvement Program. He indicated that the information supplied to MAG from the member agencies was reevaluated using the most recent EPA emissions models. Mr. Giles noted that on page two, the report includes the purchase of seventeen street sweepers by MAG member agencies. He added that the City of Phoenix and City of Peoria have paving projects listed on page two of the report. Mr. Giles indicated that there are also paving projects in the Pinal County nonattainment areas that are being implemented by Pinal County and the City of Maricopa.

8. Call for Future Agenda Items

Chair Conner indicated that the next meeting of the Committee has been scheduled for Thursday, June 23, 2016 at 1:30 p.m. He requested suggestions for future agenda items. With no further comments, the meeting was adjourned at approximately 2:10 p.m.